

The Resilience of Sensation in Urban Planning

Meredith A. Johnson

*University of South Florida
Tampa, FL*

Nathan R. Johnson

*University of South Florida
Tampa, FL*

Poroi 15,1 (January 2020)



Abstract: This article examines how sensation and affect make different kinds of resilience meaningful to communities. Through a case study, we analyze public deliberation about a proposal to expand interstates in Tampa, Florida. We describe how evidence introduced by opposing sides foregrounded conflicting sensory experiences. The resulting sensoriums upheld different aspects of the city's identity as worth maintaining. Drawing from recent scholarship defining resilience as something that can always be done otherwise, we suggest that resilience is better understood as entangled with public affect. We argue that a key point for rhetorical intervention in city planning is considering which futures and visions of resilience are being imagined for publics.

Keywords: sensorium, imaginaries, ambient rhetoric, urban planning, community engagement, space and place, infrastructure, resilience

Surprisingly enough, the most authentic Cuban bread in the world doesn't come from Cuba. It comes from a tiny 105-year-old bakery tucked under a large interstate in Tampa, Florida: La Segunda Central Bakery. La Segunda and its "Cuban" bread originated in 1915 to feed hungry cigar factory workers. Thousands of Cuban, Spanish, Italian, and German immigrants had converged in Ybor City, Tampa's Latin Quarter and the epicenter of cigar manufacturing in early 20th century America (Taylor, 2015). The Tampa-born Cuban sandwich that combined Cuban mojo marinated pork, smoked Spanish ham, Italian Genoa salami, and German mustard, pickles and cheese appealed to all. La Segunda's founder Juan Moré's exacting bread recipe called for hand-kneading, precise temperature and humidity control, and a scoring

technique in which a strip of palmetto leaf was placed atop the uncooked dough. The leaf encouraged the long, baguette-shaped loaves to crack during baking, crisping the thin, flakey crust and venting the soft, airy inside. Four generations of Morés later, little has changed. After ingredients are combined in mid-century mixers, 20,000 loaves are still hand rolled and palmetto-topped before they are manually loaded into La Segunda's ovens.

This historic bakery and its traditional bread came to play a surprising and pivotal role in quashing the development of a sprawling 6-billion-dollar interstate project that would cut through the heart of Tampa. Tampa is the fifth fastest growing metropolitan area in the nation, and the aging interstate system is buckling under the weight of traffic. The Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT) predicts road use will double in volume in many segments by 2040 ("Interstate Modernization," 2017). FDOT's fiercely contested solution, "Tampa Bay Express" (TBX), would add "luxury lanes" to the flanks of existing arterial highways: I-275 and I-4. During higher traffic periods, drivers would be subject to surge pricing with tolls reaching up to \$6.00 per use. FDOT and its supporters maintained that the new lanes would ease traffic congestion and reduce carbon emissions along highways that have been called some of the worst in the nation (Crosby, 2015). TBX opponents noted that the project would unfairly privilege wealthy suburban commuters, destroy many of the city's cultural landmarks, displace its poorest residents in the urban core, and do little to actually ease traffic congestion (Johnston & Cormier, 2016). Standing in the proposed highway's expanded path through Ybor City, La Segunda was frequently cited in public debates that pushed and stalled policy movement. Indeed, the longevity of the century-old bakery was some of the most evocative evidence responsible for the ultimate retraction of the TBX plan. Tampa's historical legacy as a city is bound to places like La Segunda and always has been.

La Segunda and similar Ybor City businesses offer some of the most important ingredients for changing or sustaining Tampa's municipal policies, and the TBX controversy teaches us something about rhetoric and resilience. There would not *be* a Tampa without Ybor City commerce (Mormino & Pozzetta, 1987). The few antebellum pioneers in the area were plagued by successive hurricanes, embattled with the Seminole they displaced, and considered a nuisance by the military authorities at Fort Brooke that actively attempted to eradicate the small settlement during the 19th century. Upon the decommissioning of Fort Brooke and the

end of the Civil War, Tampa was left with a dwindling population of less than 200 citizens and lost its incorporation several times (Brown, 1999; Welch, 2014). “Military expenditures, timber, and sugar” may have provided “the foundation for early Tampa's growth,” (Brown, 1999, p. 17), but it was the founding of Ybor City that finally stabilized the population and the region (Lastra, 2006). Thanks in part to efficient transportation provided by Henry B. Plant’s recently expanded network of steamships and railroads, cigar manufacturing entrepreneurs were enticed to set up shop in 1885 by highly motivated city officials concerned about once again losing incorporation. Only then did the City of Tampa finally and firmly take (Johnson, Cannon, Palmer, Rea, & Zarlengo, 2017). Ybor City’s booming cigar industry and its thousands of employees provided economic support for Tampa’s earliest businesses.

La Segunda Central Bakery’s history is Tampa’s history. And now, La Segunda supporters argued, relocating the business and its baked goods from the proposed highway’s path as part of urban development would compromise the essence of the city for the sake of a faster afternoon commute. During TBX discussions, La Segunda was repeatedly deployed as key evidence that pushed expert transportation consultants, city officials, and community residents toward ultimately scrapping the TBX project. In this article, we center La Segunda not just as a commonplace of urban policy deliberation but also as part of an ecology of competing *ambient imaginaries* that delineate what Tampa has been, what it is now, and what it should be in the future. Our work amplifies theories of spatial imaginaries (Watkins, 2015) and social imaginaries (Taylor, 2002) to better account for the full range of spatial, social, and sensory experiences that intervene in and invent the everyday lives of citizens, reorganizing where residents can live, work, and travel.

We locate two ambient imaginaries produced in TBX discourse: 1) Tampa as historically situated local community and 2) Tampa as global city. Each relies on competing spatial, social, and sensory evidence as it forwards different notions of what’s worth saving and how to keep it. We note that these ambient imaginaries each have unique agendas of urban resilience that refract the background sensibilities of city policy. The Tampa Bay area is a coastal plain, and like the rest of Florida, it is susceptible to some of the more violent effects of climate change. A 2019 Brookings Institute Report named the area the second-most vulnerable to climate-related costs, including fatalities, compromised agricultural yields, and

coastal damage (Muro, Victor, & Whiton, 2019). Tampa provides a hard case for resilient city planning under deteriorating environmental conditions. Resilience and city development collide frequently in discussions over municipal transportation policy because talk about urban transportation is permeated with both the prospects and promises of a shared tomorrow. In this case, tomorrow will likely include increasingly violent hurricanes that force residents to evacuate, the changing contours of shorelines (and the roads that mirror them), and even more daily commuters on already overburdened roads. According to a Traffic Volume Trends Report (2019) from the U.S. Department of Transportation's Office of Highway Policy Information, Americans are driving more than ever. Motorists drove 43% more miles in April 2019 than in April 1994, 25 years prior. And the vast majority of those vehicle miles—196.8 billion—were through urban areas including Tampa. Critical for our investigation of TBX is an understanding of resilience as responsive, systemically adaptive, persistent, and constantly transforming (McGreavy, 2016; Stormer & McGreavy, 2017). We also draw from Patrice M. Buzzanell (2010) because while we agree with McGreavy that resilience language can be fruitfully seen as poetry (and we do interrogate some of its metaphors and tropes), poetry has material effects that also demand scrutiny. Buzzanell's work provides an apparatus for approaching resilience as a set of communicative processes. After examining these processes in both Global Tampa and Localtopia Tampa, we concur with Bridie McGreavy (2016) that resilience could always be done otherwise (p. 116). To seek one form of resilience for Tampa's future, we argue, puts other notions—and imaginaries—into peril (or at least pushes them out of the spotlight).

Tampa's Ambient Imaginaries: The Global and the Local

Multiple imaginaries (Björkman & Harris, 2018; Cinar & Bender, 2007; Dougherty, 2019; Gaonkar, 2002; Potter, 2019) put in motion by TBX discourse drew from spatial and symbolic links. However, those imaginaries cannot be adequately described as only spatial or social (though they are indeed both). The futures imagined in the deliberation over transportation in Tampa Bay are rife with sensation, and we turn towards rhetoric's *sensorium* to better understand the background sensibilities that mobilized and motivated publics to action. Debra Hawhee (2015) characterized

the sensorium as “a sensing package, a bundle of constitutive, participatory tendrils” that “could offer a way to think about connective, participatory dimensions of sensing” (p. 5). Though the concept of the sensorium has transformed significantly over its theoretical life, it has consistently focused on sensations implicated in rhetorical action. The interface between language and *sensation*, *affect*, *feeling*, and *emotion* has most often been the point where the sensorium begins¹. From Hawhee and others, we take away that the sensorium transforms how one comports with the world. The sensorium also helps us to better understand the multiple and oftentimes competing futures imagined for the Tampa Bay area by publics that are themselves multiple, heterogenous, and often at odds with each other. The sensorium also presents a path for resilience to “shift its definitions and ordering strategies to open up affective modes of response within material ecologies” (McGreavy, 2016, p. 106). Elaborating on the convergence between rhetoric and sensation, Hawhee asks how we might think in terms of communal sensation without presuming sameness. We put forth *ambient imaginaries* as one answer.

Ambient imaginaries illuminate the importance of stories, practices, and discourses about place and space while also taking seriously rhetorical studies’ interest in affect, entanglement, and posthumanism. Ambient imaginaries center the transformation of sensory experiences into stories and practices that produce and maintain space and place. Clearly, we build on Thomas Rickert’s (2013) *Ambient Rhetoric*, from which we draw the name of our concept of imaginary, but more significantly, we invigorate ambience with over 100 years of rhetoric scholarship that has given our field a sense of the sensorium (Hawhee, 2015). And so we claim there is not one Tampa; there are many, and they taste, smell, look, sound, and feel different. Of the ambient imaginaries that compete for preservation in TBX-related discourse,² two in particular help

¹ We are less interested in pinning down and teasing apart these terms than in better understanding how they are always evolving and affecting each other, simultaneously making a difference in the stakes of policy decisions that reorganize shared urban space. As Hawhee (2015) noted, the sensorium itself also resists dissection, refusing to separate the senses.

² To support our claims, we reviewed municipal, state, and federal reports, press coverage, maps, online discussion forums, social media, archived historical data and atlases, videos of public hearings, promotional materials, trade journals, training modules, court records, and state laws from diverse stakeholders, including transit agencies, mass

us understand La Segunda's power in swaying urban policy: 1) Tampa as a global city, networked into the economies of the future, and 2) Tampa as a set of unique parts—a "localtopia." Neither imaginary is more "real" than the other, but their mobilization in public deliberation produces radically different futures.

Global Tampa is a city on the rise, recognized for its participation in a world economy. Tampa is projected into the same tropological landscape as similarly sized cities (e.g., St. Louis, New Orleans, Minneapolis) and aspirational peers (e.g., Tokyo, New York City, Beijing). This ambient imaginary foregrounds affective experiences of place that connect capital and communication across the world, available to vacationers and residents alike. The feel of handing a crisp 20-dollar bill to a flight attendant within a pressurized cabin retrieves the same Diet Coke, regardless of which city the plane is en route to. In Global Tampa, fans can hear Ariana Grande, Elton John, and Céline Dion sing in a single season or lose their voices cheering for Hulk Hogan, along with 65,000 other wrestling fans at Wrestlemania 36. Whereas Tampa as global ambient imaginary draws on sensorial affects that can be reproduced widely and standardized, Tampa as localtopia enforces boundaries and singular sensory experiences that span smaller distances. Localtopia Tampa is an unreplicable city. It is home to a particular blend of food (Cuban sandwiches, deviled crab, Sopa de Garbanzo), activities (professional wrestling, cigar rolling, and organized crime), and civic celebrations (Gasparilla Pirate Festival, Florida Strawberry Festival, and Sunset Music Festival). This ambient imaginary forwards the city's singularity as its primary identity. Both of these ambient imaginaries—the global and the local—differently envision transportation systems that are adaptive, responsive, and able to continually accommodate transformation.

Why do we look to Tampa and its imaginaries to better understand resilience? Stormer and McGreavy argue that rhetorical theory is enriched when it takes resilience, meaning adaptability to uncertain change, as one of its foundational commonplaces. Instead of identifying "rhetorics of," Stormer and McGreavy suggest it is better to foreground "rhetorics with" (2017, p. 4). For them, this shift invites humans to see themselves as changing alongside the places and species they share space with. Their argument follows critical impulses adopted by many within the posthumanities who

media, grassroots citizen groups, research centers, think tanks, and Metropolitan Planning Organizations (MPOs).

are furiously trying to right the global problems of the anthropocene (Braidotti, 2019, p. 90). Resilience as rhetoric points to how our shared ecosphere transforms and is transformed by rhetoric. We see the city as an ideal place to better understand rhetoric and resilience. Cities bring many of the older binaries that have been challenged by rhetoricians into focus: human/environment, natural/artificial, urban/rural, among many others. As more and more of the human population moves across the urban/rural boundary, cities are increasingly key spaces of rhetorical-material-physical transformation (Hodson & Marvin, 2010). The sensorium is critical for understanding resilience in urban space because it troubles the atmospheric and personal boundaries of who or what is smelling, tasting, feeling, and sensing. The city is a critical locus for the anthropocene.

Global Tampa

As a rapidly growing city that is a hub of international travel, Tampa finds itself targeted by the same homogenizing discourses that transform spaces across the globe (Wilson, 2014). The language of globalization is not limited to one narrative, but it does hinge on commonplaces that conjure a shared way of living together in the same interconnected space (Robertson & Khondker, 1998). The most rudimentary globalization discourse assumes a continuous, uniform space comprised of discrete, familiar places (Dickinson, 2002). The supporting topography draws strength from appeals to neoliberal, network markets dependent on effortless transactions between unproblematically connected global nodes (Tsing, 2004, p. 3). Global imaginaries pledge to invigorate economies by promising egalitarian, economic benefits among distant countries and communities, which they ultimately fail to deliver (Wallerstein, 2014). Despite its obvious oversights, globalization discourse still grounds many of the everyday practices and sensibilities of Tampa's municipal policy. It offers an underlying set of assumptions that justify global trade that pillages resources for the benefit of already powerful actors (Korzeniewicz, 1994). In our case, globalization discourse offers the reasoning to produce Cuban bread in Tampa to *import* consumers from around the world (Barnes, 2018). TBX policies become technologies to support that movement. Commonplaces supporting globalization tend to *overlook* and *forget* localized hybridities produced by shared economies touching down in heterogenous, multifaceted places. Tropes of globalization overwrite hybrid, diverse cultural identities in order to foreground a frictionless, shared future where

consumer-residents labor together within a unified, egalitarian global economy defined through the instantiation of “global” markets.

The effects of globalization discourse(s) can be unpredictable for governance. Even a cursory glance at Tampa’s history immediately highlights counterexamples of oversimplified, homogenizing discourse. Tampa is simultaneously like and unlike the other large cities it is often compared with. It draws its identities from a mixture of globalizing language and local spaces. It is a sprawling, metropolitan region, rich with conflicts forever (re)situating who is considered in and outside its borders. Counterintuitively, for example, affluent white residents of the 1950s living in nearby bay area suburbs resisted municipal annexation to avoid taxation that would benefit Cuban immigrants living in the state-recognized city limits (Kerstein, 2001, pp. 110-111). These residents hoped to incorporate their own separate city with services designed only for them and did their best to break connections to other Tampa residents, including those businesses like *La Segunda* that were situated near the city’s urban center. Whereas globalization discourse often imagines Tampa as a unified node, its history is far more complex. Places are ever-shifting sets of overlapping, coeval spaces (Massey, 2005). Globalization commonplaces often elide this continual emergence and encourage a mode of resilience that attempts to conceal conflicts, hybridity, difference, and diversity to foreground a unified and uniform Tampa that is part of a global network. Globalizing evidence is overlooked that does not support that unified vision, including documentation that demonstrates how wider roads do not abet smoother transportation (Duranton & Turner, 2009), that roads are major producers of pollution that hurt the city’s air quality (Zhang & Batterman, 2013), and that the ability to purchase and maintain automobiles entrenches and reinforces existing class differences (King, Smart, & Manville, 2019).

Support for the TBX project depended on situating Tampa in relation to other large, global cities. Atlanta, for example, was often cited as an example of poor interstate planning and mismanaged traffic. Atlanta comparisons offered examples of how to *not* be a global Tampa, imagined as “America’s Next Great City” (Naisbitt, 1988). These comparisons flattened Tampa by making its topography analogous to Atlanta’s. Yet examples flourish of ways that Atlanta and Tampa both fluctuate or fail to conform to global discourse. Comparing Tampa to Baltimore (as it was in several of

FDOT's data visualizations), for example, doesn't adequately account for Tampa's sprawling smaller municipalities and bedroom communities. TBX's proponents suggested that in order to compete and cooperate with other high-growth, urban areas, Tampa must include modernized interstates to accommodate new flows of capital and labor. They noted that express lanes have been implemented in Los Angeles, Salt Lake City, Austin, Houston, and Minneapolis/St. Paul to facilitate more predictable commutes. According to TBX supporters, the aging, deteriorating transportation infrastructure is a relic from a different time and space that belonged to a less-populated and more congested Tampa.

As they made these claims, advocates continually described enclosed, personal vehicles, moving at high speeds over roads and bridges that could have just as easily served any major metropolitan area. Tampa's global ambient imaginary depends on a sensorium that is experienced largely in cars on multilane highways aided by networked mobility technologies, including express lanes and wrong-way driving detection. The phenomenon of highway hypnosis, when drivers "zone out" but continue driving, exemplifies the lived sensoriums produced and transported through Tampa's global imaginary (Larue, Rakotonirainy, & Pettitt, 2011). Suburban commuters drive to work simultaneously during rush hour, separated from the scorching, seemingly endless pavement and ever-present humidity in enclosed, temperature-controlled boxes. By making space feel uniform, global Tampa also separates drivers from those terrains that are bypassed and deflects attention from Tampa's urban core and its poorest neighborhoods. Commuters watch panoramas fly by with no distinct impression or appreciable smell. They often operate their vehicles in that seemingly dreamlike state, reaching their destinations without remembering actually navigating the routinized space (Schivelbusch, 1977, p. 63; Yanko & Spalek, 2014, p. 266). The mind wanders and the body glides on the trajectory entrenched within the material constraints of a global space. The ambience feels non-changing, and the driver is lulled into an almost hypnotic state.

Resilience, in this discourse, aims for the reproduction and perpetuation of frictionless, flowing driving. The resilience of globalization is the deep slumber of forgetting historical differences. Drivers share a unified city, separately. Buzzanell (2010) offers us a schema of resilience's communication processes that reveals five different points of resiliency undergirding this

ambient imaginary: 1) crafting normalcy (maintaining the status quo and foreclosing alternative possibilities); 2) affirming identity anchors (asserting enduring identity discourses that individuals and groups have previously used to understand themselves and how they relate to others); 3) maintaining communication networks (especially those ways of talking that link organizations to each other); 4) putting alternative logics to work (even when those methods seem contradictory or require a complete reframing of the situation at hand); and 5) legitimizing negative feelings while foregrounding productive action (acknowledging emotions including anger or loss before moving beyond them in the service of more important goals) (pp. 3-9). Resilient Global Tampa highlights the *normalcy* of road expansion as techne for municipal enhancement via economic development, *identities* that foreground residents as individual commuters moving through space to support that economic development, and *logics* that forward “thriving” cities as the sum of their involvement with global economic and *communication networks*. *Negative feelings are legitimized* by suggesting that the destruction of spaces that don’t fit this imaginary is unfortunate but necessary for the city to flourish. We note that discussions that center road expansion as the *heart* of economic development depend on a metaphor that compares the cities roads to a biological circulation system. In this model, the interstate to be widened is comparable to an aorta or jugular that needs to be stented for the health of the patient. The now almost dead poetry of invoking “arterial” roads forwards this imaginary. And given this language, the city becomes a living, breathing, pulsating organism. The ambient imaginary beats with the rhythms of global capital that is colonizing through the flows of the networked global city. These flows position residents as the “lifeblood” moving through the circulation system. The TBX project positions the newly stented roads as the *logics* for improving the health of the city. In practice, this means privileging the normalcy of sensations associated with automobile travel and traveling together alone. Normal experience consists of being in an enclosed space, smelling the interior of one’s private vehicle mingled with road exhaust, and the proprioceptive experience of being moved (ideally) at high velocities on busy roads.³ (Global development as road expansion isn’t so good for those prone to motion sickness). Meanwhile, we note the problems of the arterial metaphor. It

³ Stang Våland, and Georg (2019) introduced the idea of “spacing identity” that foregrounds how identity is coeval with entanglements in artifacts, physical spaces, and affective dissonance.

forwards a notion of normalcy that depends on universal access to expensive automobiles (along with all of their supplemental costs) and the claim that wider roads somehow guarantee a better place. Global Tampa's arterial metaphor emphasizes movement and economic growth over all else, with bodies separated from neighbors and neighborhoods by thousands of pounds of metal moving at 60 mph velocities.

People are situated in this imaginary as the throughput in a biological system dependent on a circulatory system. Global ambient imaginaries are overwhelmed with the sensations of perfect road travel: a smooth drive in a climate-controlled automobile that moves residents to and from their work, home, and leisure with minimal impedance. Imagine sitting behind the wheel of your luxury car on your way to your ideal workplace and listening to your favorite songs on the sound system while hitting every green light along the journey. This is the imaginary that road expansion forwarded when TBX advocates offered toll lanes as the solution to the far more common and less ideal experience of road travel in Tampa. Moving across roads more often involves honking horns, vibrating vehicles with loud engines, violent starts and stops to avoid accidents, and the smell of automobile exhaust. Arterial metaphors suggest flow, and the ensuing ambient imaginary forwards an ideal sensorium that lends itself to a road experience that reinforces the demands of economies moving labor to and from high-paying, innovative jobs. And although the language of TBX forwards an experience of flow, the experience of I-275 invokes sensations akin to heart attack.

Local Tampa

Global Tampa's ambient weaknesses invited La Segunda's inclusion in the policy making while inviting an alternative set of sensory experiences.⁴ While TBX supporters tended to focus on fluid sensations of economically important car travel, La Segunda's

⁴ We observe that very rarely do TBX protesters describe *what* La Segunda represents and *why* it matters as an important part of the city. To better understand the sensorium that is only hinted at in TBX discourse (and Tampa as localtopia), we expanded our search to descriptions of La Segunda in non-TBX contexts as well. These additional sources include newspaper articles and reviews, Yelp testimonies, oral histories with the founders, television news segments exploring La Segunda and its history, and YouTube videos created by residents of the city and city leaders.

sensorium troubled and rearranged the normalizing imaginary of a global Tampa imagined as a technologically efficient economy. Patrons to La Segunda's localtopia are first "greeted with a delicious aroma" that cuts through the parking lot and surrounding area. One cannot help but smell the small bakery for miles. From there, the "colors and aromas draw you in" to explore the cases of baked goods and menus filled with tempting choices, including *café con leche* (coffee with milk), *tortica de moron* (cookies), and *quesitos* (cheese turnovers). If fourth generation proprietor Copeland Moré had his way, La Segunda would serve only bags of plantain chips to go with Cuban sandwiches (Carlton, 2015). Upbeat Latin music plays over speakers. The bakery is a popular location and tourists are usually crowded in with throngs of hungry, regular customers, all waiting for their turn to order. Once handed their *media noche*, coca buns, and guava turnovers, customers eagerly consume foods perfected with techniques refined over the last century that have come to define Tampa (the "Big Guava" is among Tampa's most popular nicknames) (Wynne, 2016).

Residents and visitors refracted the gustatory and olfactory experience of La Segunda's bread into an "authentic" Tampa. Authenticity acted as a critical aspect of localtopia. Numerous online reviewers and TBX opponents praised La Segunda's authenticity. We note that authenticity language, especially when used in culinary contexts to describe non-European foods, often supports white supremacy. Authenticity discourse frequently reinforces racist stereotypes about culture (Clair et al., 2011) and food hygiene (LeMesurier, 2017), denies non-Western restaurants the same creative latitude as their Eurocentric competitors (Karaosmanoglu, 2013), and ignores the influence of colonial oppression on cuisine in favor of a flattened, romanticized and non-existent ideal (Abarca, 2004; Gaytán, 2008). Visions of localtopia reinforce authentic business as culturally important to the future of Tampa.

Like Global Tampa's tropes, authenticity and localization encourage their own oversights. Authenticity discourse is leveraged in Local Tampa to protect cultural resources as it simultaneously essentializes culture. La Segunda is located in rapidly gentrifying Ybor City. Ybor City nearly died following the Great Depression but was saved by investments in commercial businesses that originally attracted artists and now mid-career professionals (Mormino & Pozzetta, 1987). While the original Ybor City was settled almost exclusively by a small population of Cuban immigrants, today's

Ybor is a diverse Ybor (“Race and Ethnicity,” 2018). And although it is not as affluent as some parts of Tampa, its housing prices have risen fast and furiously (Trulia, 2019). To point to the authenticity of a Cuban bakery as the real Ybor is to elide a history of gentrification and urban renewal that is complex and nuanced. TBX protesters and champions of La Segunda’s sensorium were often the voices of gentrifying residents living near the highway with more reason to be concerned about their property values than the quality of their bread. As such, La Segunda’s invocation in TBX policy deliberation pointed to numerous contradictions in overwhelming forces of late modernity’s capitalism. To claim authenticity is to overlook the hybridity and history of the numerous groups who now make Tampa their home.

Authenticity discourse troubles the sensorium and the ambient imaginary. La Segunda’s authenticity language drew potency from its otherness “continually tethered to a feeling of strangeness...that cannot be assimilated into the norm” (Kelly, 2014, p. 52). Tampa’s history of racial tension is core to its identity because of the diversity of people who have claimed it as home. The same Cuban immigrants who bought lunch break bread from the bakeries, for instance, were also consistently demonized as “outlaw” labor activists by local white politicians (Kerstein, 2001, p. 27). La Segunda was also racialized but inoculated with a kind of racial tourism, which Anjali Vats (2014) noted “permits interaction with difference without social, political, or economic obligation while, consistent with post-racial ideologies, recognizing difference for its exoticness and novelty instead of its continued material significance” (p. 114). The bakery’s bread was valuable as an asset to powerful residents of Tampa because it fed the lucrative cigar industry. As its exotic gustatory appeal also became valued by the other residents of Tampa, the bakery gained acceptance through its inoculated otherness. La Segunda, its situatedness, its bread, its smells and so on, acted as racialized material at the boundaries between rhetoric’s sensorium and the city’s ambient imaginaries. The tastes, smells, and sights of La Segunda carried the racial boundaries that had been sedimented during the city’s history. Sensations served to order the imaginaries into cognitive spaces that piggyback on physical spaces. With La Segunda safely exoticized, local protesters could deploy its “authenticity” during TBX protest.

In Tampa, La Segunda frequently served as a metonym for the historic neighborhoods that would bear the brunt of the

construction. In contrast to pro-TBX discourse that detailed Tampa as a part of a new global order, urban core advocacy groups combating the plan cited the bakery's singularity and irreplaceability. For example, on their anti-TBX website homepage, Sunshine Citizens warned "100 Years of History: La Segunda Bakery Destroyed by FDOT" ("Stop Tampa Bay Express," 2019). Similar language was circulated by The Heights Collective, another grassroots citizens' organization, at Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO) meetings ("Hillsborough Metropolitan," 2015). Press coverage reported that La Segunda Bakery "would be removed if the plan goes as proposed" (Perry, 2016). Although provocative, this language was an oversimplification. City officials had planned to appropriate La Segunda property via eminent domain but the extent of this appropriation remains unclear. The owners may have ultimately been forced to move their business, but that plan was never finalized. FDOT officials did confirm that La Segunda would lose at least lose the portion of its parking lot near Interstate 4 (Travis, 2016). During discussions, TBX opponents would often point to the travesty of losing the business and allow the business's local, situated reputation—built in no small part on citizens' prior sensory experience—to forward their argument. Protest marches were routed so that citizens passed by the popular bakery (Perry, 2016). Similarly, a bicycle tour led by the owner of a local specialty shop provided an up close of impacted neighborhoods and brought stakeholders to La Segunda's door. "It's not just an overlay on a map," he promised, "but a truly hands-on experience of what will change, what streets are going away and what homes and significant structures will be demolished" (Travis, 2016). These co-present modes of asserting La Segunda's importance required interested publics to engage not just with TBX discourse but with a sensorium emanating from the business.

A majority of participants in and witnesses to TBX deliberation were not directly involved in these marches, which primarily acted as publicity stunts that reminded larger publics of the significance of the well-known bakery. The city of Tampa officially acknowledged the bakery's importance during a day of recognition set aside specifically for the business's 100th anniversary, and Mayor Bob Buckhorn highlighted that "this is one of those Tampa traditions everyone knows about" (Buckhorn & Harris, 2017). And while Tampa residents often have consumed La Segunda's bread or pastries on site or at the local restaurants and grocery stores supplied by the bakery, this is not just any small business serving a select, local clientele. La Segunda's bread is sold wholesale, fresh

and frozen, nationwide “to restaurants, grocery stores, hotels, schools, entertainment parks, and major food distribution companies across the country” (“Wholesale Cuban,” n.d.). The bread calls forth a different sensory experience than global Tampa, but it moves via the same global networks that are invoked by pro-TBX discourse. Because there is no restaurant seating inside the Ybor City bakery, it’s not an uncommon experience for Tampa’s residents to take their food back to the parking lot and consume the textures, aromas, and tastes of La Segunda in the confines of their own cars. These bakery-infused automobiles are one of the lived spaces where the sensoriums of global and local ambient imaginaries collide. La Segunda’s sensorium wafts through Tampa’s publics and beyond.

La Segunda constitutes resilience differently than pro-TBX imaginaries. Localtopia *crafts normalcy* by emphasizing the preservation of Tampa’s origins and landmarks. The Bay Area’s unique character and rituals are maintained by prioritizing residential history over road expansion that would slice through and damage established communities. Tampa as localtopia affirms *identities that anchor* longtime residents in well-established neighborhoods. State and local officials are intrusive outsiders. “Authentic” Tampeños honor the city’s Latin roots and demand roads that adapt to entrenched contours (Guzzo, 2019). *Communication networks* are created and sustained to vigorously debate public policy. Advocacy groups, grassroots organizations, and local businesses mobilize to push back against city and state officials online via social media and in person at marches, protests, farmers’ markets, and MPO board and committee meetings. *Alternative logics* of local Tampa support prudent growth and infrastructure designed to support multiple modes of transportation. Resilient transportation systems are reframed as inclusive of and responsive to pedestrians, bicyclists, and mass transit riders who can travel safely and extensively alongside drivers. *Productive action is foregrounded and negative feelings are legitimized* when homeowners and small business owners protect their property values from pervasive capitalism’s market forces by appealing to a sense of a long-term, shared community.

Global and Local Sensory Resiliences

Ambient imaginaries focus the attention of publics deciding which parts of the material environment to carry into the future. In urban Tampa, we find what department store designers, food engineers,

and perfume manufacturers have known for decades: tastes, smells, and sensations mobilize action in networks of all stripes. Global imaginaries lauded the sensations of free-flowing traffic in temperature-controlled vehicles. Those who imagined Tampa's future as a global city favored transportation mechanisms that encourage the continued flow of goods, people, and ideas in, out, and through the city. These are the same neoliberal forces that have also led global populations to the brink of climate apocalypse. The 6-billion-dollar road construction project was ultimately derailed by protesters who invoked sights, smells, and tastes that fortified a sense of Tampa that was being threatened by the same neoliberal logics. They grounded their opposition in a sensorium that had been percolating within Tampa's cultural geography for decades. Resistance came in the form of freshly baked bread, pastries, and sandwiches that nourished a sense of publicness threatened by global transformations. If resilience is something that can always be done otherwise, it is enriched by considering rhetoric's sensorium as a key lever for identifying and distilling values that motivate communities entangled in shared problems.

Copyright © 2020 Meredith A. Johnson and Nathan R. Johnson

Reference List

- Abarca, M. (2004). Authentic or not, it's original. *Food and Foodways*, 12(1), 1-25.
- Barnes, S. B. (2018). In the home of the Cuban sandwich, this bakery has mastered the most important ingredient. Retrieved from <https://www.mic.com/articles/187189/in-the-home-of-the-cuban-sandwich-this-tampa-bakery-has-mastered-the-most-important-ingredient>
- Björkman, L., & Harris, A. (2018). Engineering cities: Mediating materialities, infrastructural imaginaries and shifting regimes of urban expertise. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 42(2), 244-262.
- Braidotti, R. (2019). *Posthuman knowledge*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.
- Brown, C. (1999). *Tampa before the Civil War*. Tampa, FL: University of Tampa Press.
- Buckhorn, B., & Harris, J. [CityofTampa] (2017, May 4). *Tampa traditions - La Segunda Central Bakery & La Naviera Coffee Mills* [Video file]. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=M9_B9yWsR9c&list=PLYHSCkGplHFm6R2l_Xkd5pyEV8OJ4f3aB
- Buzzanell, P. M. (2010). Resilience: Talking, resisting, and imagining new normalcies into being. *Journal of Communication*, 60(1), 1-14.
- Carlton, S. (2015, February). A tasty tradition. *Tampa Bay Times*, p. 1B.
- Cinar, A., & Bender, T. (Eds.). (2007). *Urban imaginaries: Locating the modern city*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.
- Clair, R. P., Holyoak, I. C., Hill, T. E., Rajan, P., Angeli, E. L., Carrion, M. L., ... & Sastry, S. (2011). Engaging cultural narratives of the ethnic restaurant: Discursive practices of hybridity, authenticity, and commoditization. In N. K. Denzin (Ed.), *Studies in symbolic interaction* (pp. 135-161).

- Crosby, R. (2015, April). Bay Area traffic ranks 11th Worst in nation. *Tampa Bay Times*, p. 1B.
- Dickinson, G. (2002). Joe's rhetoric finding authenticity at Starbucks. *Rhetoric Society Quarterly*, 32(4), 5–27.
- Dougherty, D. M. (2019). Urban redevelopment, school closure, and the abstract space of Black schooling in Prince George's County, Maryland, 1968-1972. *Journal of Urban History*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0096144219836937>
- Duranton, G., & Turner, M. A. (2009). *The fundamental law of road congestion: Evidence from US cities* (NBER Working Paper No. 15376).
- Gaonkar, D. P. (2002). Toward new imaginaries: An introduction. *Public Culture*, 14(1), 1–19.
- Gaytán, M. S. (2008). From Sombreros to sincronizadas: Authenticity, ethnicity, and the Mexican restaurant industry. *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography*, 37(3), 314–341.
- Guzzo, P. (2019). Are you a Tampan, Tampanian or Tampeño? *Tampa Bay Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.tampabay.com/tampa/are-you-a-tampan-tampanian-or-tampexf10-20190110/>
- Hawhee, D. (2015). Rhetoric's sensorium. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*, 101(1), 2-17.
- Hillsborough Metropolitan Planning Organization August 2015 agenda packet*. (2015). Retrieved from http://www.planhillsborough.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/12/MPO_August2015_FullAgendaPacket.pdf
- Hodson, M., & Marvin, S. (2010). Urbanism in the anthropocene: Ecological urbanism or premium ecological enclaves? *City: Analysis of Urban Trends, Culture, Theory, Policy, Action*, 14(3), 298-313.
- “Interstate modernization fact sheet” (2017). Retrieved from <http://www.tampabaynext.com/wp->

content/uploads/2017/08/Interstate-Modernization-FS-080817.pdf

- Johnson, M. A., Cannon, P., Palmer, R., Rea, J. M., & Zarlengo, T. (2017). Logotypes in place: A visual rhetorical history of Cigar City. In C. S. Wyatt & D. N. DeVoss (Eds.), *Type matters: The rhetoricity of letterforms* (pp. 253-281). Anderson, SC: Parlor Press.
- Johnston, C., & Cormier, A. (2016). State's answer to Howard Frankland traffic: Pay a toll or lose a lane. *Tampa Bay Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.tampabay.com/news/transportation/roads/state-s-answer-to-howard-frankland-traffic-pay-a-toll-or-lose-a-lane/2294918>.
- Karaosmanoglu, D. (2013). Globalised cuisine, non-national identities and the individual: Staging Turkishness in Turkish-speaking restaurants in London. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 34(4), 371–386.
- Kelly, C. R. (2014) Bizarre foods: White privilege and the neocolonial palate. In M. Triage and M. Lacy (Eds.), *Race and hegemonic struggle in the United States* (pp. 43-67). London, UK: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Kerstein, R. J. (2001). *Politics and growth in twentieth-century Tampa*. Gainesville, FL: University of Florida Press.
- King, D. A., Smart, M. J., & Manville, M. (2019). The poverty of the carless: Toward universal auto access. *Journal of Planning Education and Research*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0739456X18823252>
- Korzeniewicz, M. (1994). Commodity chains and marketing strategies: Nike and the global athletic footwear industry. In G. Gereffi & M. Korzeniewicz (Eds.), *Commodity Chains and Global Capitalism* (pp. 247–265). Westport, CT: Greenwood Press.
- Larue, G. S., Rakotonirainy, A., & Pettitt, A. N. (2011). Driving performance impairments due to hypovigilance on monotonous roads. *Accident Analysis & Prevention*, 43(6), 2037–2046.

- Lastra, F. T. (2006). *Ybor City: The making of a landmark town*. Tampa, FL: University of Tampa Press.
- LeMesurier, J. L. (2017). Uptaking race: Genre, MSG, and Chinese dinner. *Poroi*, 12(2). Retrieved from <https://ir.uiowa.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1253&context=poroi>
- Massey, D. (2005). *For space*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- McGreavy, B. (2016). Resilience as discourse. *Environmental Communication*, 10(1), 104–121.
- Mormino, G. R., & Pozzetta, G. E. (1987). *The immigrant world of Ybor City: Italians and their Latin neighbors in Tampa, 1885-1985*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press.
- Muro, M., Victor, D. G., & Whiton, J. (2019). How the geography of climate damage could make the politics less polarizing. Retrieved from <https://www.brookings.edu/research/how-the-geography-of-climate-damage-could-make-the-politics-less-polarizing/>
- Naisbitt, J. (1988). *Megatrends: Ten new directions transforming our lives*. New York, NY: Warner Books.
- Perry, M. (2016). Anti-TBX citizens protest in V.M. Ybor [Political Blog]. Retrieved from <http://saintpetersblog.com/anti-tbx-citizens-protest-v-m-ybor/>
- Potter, E. (2019). Contesting imaginaries in the Australian city: Urban planning, public storytelling and the implications for climate change. *Urban Studies*. Advance online publication. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0042098018821304>
- Race and Ethnicity in Ybor City, Tampa, Florida. (2018, September 14). Statistical Atlas. Retrieved from <https://statisticalatlas.com/neighborhood/Florida/Tampa/Ybor-City/Race-and-Ethnicity>
- Rickert, T. (2013). *Ambient rhetoric: The attunements of rhetorical being*. Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press.

- Robertson, R., & Khondker, H. H. (1998). Discourses of globalization: Preliminary considerations. *International Sociology*, 13(1), 25–40.
- Schivelbusch, W. (2014). *The railway journey: The industrialization of time and space in the nineteenth century*. Oakland, CA: University of California Press.
- Stang Våland, M., & Georg, S. (2019). Spacing identity: Unfolding social and spatial-material entanglements of identity performance. *Scandinavian Journal of Management*, 35(2), 101049.
- “Stop Tampa Bay Express.” (2019). *Sunshine Citizens*. Retrieved from <http://stoptbx.sunshinecitizens.org/>
- Stormer, N., & McGreavy, B. (2017). Thinking ecologically about rhetoric’s ontology: Capacity, vulnerability, and resilience. *Philosophy and Rhetoric*, 50(1), 1–25.
- Taylor, C. (2002). Modern social imaginaries. *Public Culture*, 14(1), 91–124.
- Taylor, T. (2015) Tampa at the sunset of western civilization. In J. Rice (Ed.), *Florida* (pp. 73 - 85). Anderson, SC: Parlor Press.
- Travis, H. A. (2016, January). Bike tour gives up-close look at impact of Tampa Bay Express interchange project. *Tampa Bay Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.tampabay.com/news/transportation/bike-tour-gives-up-close-look-at-impact-of-tampa-bay-express-interchange/2262629>
- Trulia. (2019). Real estate data for Ybor City. Retrieved from https://www.trulia.com/real_estate/Ybor_City-Tampa/8270/market-trends/
- Tsing, A. L. (2004). *Friction: An ethnography of global connection*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- U. S. Department of Transportation. (2019). *Traffic Volume Trends*. Retrieved from https://www.fhwa.dot.gov/policyinformation/travel_monitoring/19aprtvt/19aprtvt.pdf

- Vats, A. (2014). Racechange is the new Black: Racial accessorizing and racial tourism in high fashion as constraints on rhetorical agency. *Communication, Culture, and Critique*, 7(1), 112-135.
- Wallerstein, I. (2014). The modern world-system as a capitalist world-economy. In F. J. Lechner & J. Boli (Eds.), *The Globalization Reader* (pp. 56–62). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Watkins, J. (2015). Spatial imaginaries research in geography: Synergies, tensions, and new directions. *Geography Compass*, 9(9), 508–522.
- Welch, W. C. (2014). Incorporation history. Retrieved from <https://www.tampagov.net/city-clerk/info/archives/city-of-tampa-incorporation-history>
- “Wholesale Cuban bread: Fresh from Ybor City and South Tampa.” (n.d.). Retrieved from <https://www.lasegundabakery.com/wholesale>
- Wilson, D. H. (2014). The global trope and urban redevelopment: The American experience. *Geographica Helvetica*, 69, 79–88.
- Wynne, S. K. (2016, September). Once king of Halloween revelry, Guavaween returns to roots as a kitschy parade, after party. *Tampa Bay Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.tampabay.com/news/humaninterest/once-king-of-halloween-revelry-guavaween-returns-to-roots-as-a-kitschy/2295529>
- Yanko, M. R., & Spalek, T. M. (2014). Driving with the wandering mind: The effect that mind-wandering has on driving performance. *Human Factors*, 56(2), 260–269.
- Zhang, K., & Batterman, S. (2013). Air pollution and health risks due to vehicle traffic. *The Science of the Total Environment*, 450-451, 307–316.