

## NOTES AND COMMENT

The twelfth annual convention of the League of Iowa Municipalities was held at Fort Dodge on September 21-23, 1909.

Arrangements are being made for an All-American Exposition to be held at Berlin in the heart of Europe during the coming summer.

A number of documents and papers relating to the history of the fur trade in the Michigan country have recently been added to the Burton Library.

A joint conference of the American Civic Association and the National Municipal League was held at Cincinnati, Ohio, November 15 to 18, 1909.

The fifteenth annual meeting of the Central Division of the Modern Language Association of America was held at Iowa City, December 28-30, 1909.

The twentieth annual meeting of the Iowa Library Association was held at Des Moines, October 12-14, 1909. Mr. Irving B. Richman, of Muscatine, was elected President for the ensuing year.

The legislature of the State of Indiana at its last session failed to make an appropriation for carrying on the work of the Department of Indiana Archives and History after the close of the present fiscal year.

A notable archaeological discovery has been made in Arizona by Professor Edgar L. Hewett. In an unfrequented part of the Navaho reservation he found a series of caves cut in the rocky walls of a cañon. These caves are filled with all sorts of interesting archaeological remains.

The League of American Municipalities held its annual meeting at Montreal during the last week of August. The commission form of city government was the principal topic of discussion. St. Paul



has been selected as the place of the next meeting, and the officers for the ensuing year are Alderman David Heineman of Detroit, and Mr. John MacVicar of Des Moines, as President and Secretary respectively.

The efforts of Illinois to secure a primary election law that will stand the test of constitutionality have thus far been unsuccessful. The law of February, 1908, has been declared unconstitutional by the Supreme Court of the State, making the third law of this nature to receive an adverse decision in four years.

A joint meeting of the Iowa Society of the Archaeological Institute of America, The Iowa Anthropological Society, and The Iowa Branch of the American Folk-Lore Society was held at Iowa City, November 26 and 27, 1909. The principal addresses were: *New Light from Old Lamps*, by Rev. J. George; and *The Story of the Isle of Man*, by Mrs. A. M. Mosher.

A Bureau of Municipal Reference has recently been established in connection with the University extension work of The University of Wisconsin. The purpose of this bureau is to collect and make accessible all sorts of material relative to municipal problems. Lecturers will also be prepared to supply the demands for lectures on various subjects of municipal activity.

The American Historical Association and the American Economic Association celebrated their twenty-fifth anniversaries at the annual meetings held in New York City, December 27 to 31, 1909. Meetings of the American Political Science Association, the American Statistical Association, the American Sociological Society, the American Association for Labor Legislation, and a number of other associations and societies were held at the same time and place. It was a notable gathering which should be productive of much good in the various lines of activity which the different bodies represent.

Azro B. F. Hildreth, a pioneer Iowa editor, died at his home in Charles City on November 29, 1909. Mr. Hildreth was born in Chelsea, Vermont, February 29, 1816, and came to Iowa in 1856. For fourteen years he was the editor of the *Charles City Weekly Republican-Intelligencer*. In 1870 he retired from newspaper work



and the remainder of his life was spent in looking after the interests of his estate. During these years, by his benefactions and business enterprise, he was a potent factor in the growth of Charles City. Mr. Hildreth was the author of *The Life and Times of Azro B. F. Hildreth*, a book containing material of value to the student of Iowa history.

COMMENTS ON "THE BATTLE OF SHILOH"

It is not often that a writer of history succeeds in being so accurate in his presentation of facts and so fair and non-partisan in his judgments as to satisfy those who either as participants in or as living witnesses of the events described have or believe they have first-hand information. Mr. J. W. Rich is, therefore, to be congratulated upon the comments which have followed the publication of his account of *The Battle of Shiloh* which appeared in the October, 1909, number of THE IOWA JOURNAL OF HISTORY AND POLITICS.

Upon the request of the editor of THE IOWA JOURNAL OF HISTORY AND POLITICS permission has been secured to publish extracts from a few of the letters which have come to the author of *The Battle of Shiloh*. With but one exception the letters from which the following extracts are taken were addressed to Mr. Rich.

HEADQUARTERS DEPARTMENT OF THE LAKES,  
CHICAGO, ILL., Nov. 8, 1909.

MY DEAR SIR:

I hasten to thank you for the pamphlet on "The Battle of Shiloh" which has just been received. I have already glanced through it, and have read a few pages which have proved most interesting to me, and confirm the story of that great battle as I have heard it described by my father and General Sherman, as well as by many others who participated on that field.

I shall treasure your pamphlet among the archives of my family, and it will occupy an honored place in my library.

With many thanks for your kind thought of me and for your labor of love in placing the history of our country in a true light, believe me,

Very gratefully and sincerely yours,

FREDERICK D. GRANT.

P. S. Some time I hope to write my recollections of my father and would like to quote your pamphlet (possibly in full), of course giving you credit. May I do so?

F. D. G.



[Second Letter]

CHICAGO, ILL., Dec. 18, 1909.

DEAR SIR:

I read your article with the greatest interest and consider it the best conceived and most complete article on that battle of any I have ever seen, and I am very grateful to you for having written it.

Believe me,

Most sincerely yours,

FREDERICK D. GRANT.

[Frederick D. Grant is the son of General U. S. Grant and is Major General in the U. S. Army.]

COUNCIL BLUFFS, IOWA, Dec. 13, 1909.

MY DEAR COMRADE:

I received your pamphlet on the Battle of Shiloh. I had already read it in the Historical Quarterly that had been sent to me, and I read it the second time. It is one of the best and clearest statements of the Battle that I have ever seen. It is especially so on account of its maps. I have read, of course, nearly all the statements in relation to the battle that have been published, and also those of Secretary Reed, and I have also heard Generals Grant and Sherman discuss the battle very freely. . . . You make so clear in your paper the reason why there were so many men at the Landing than others called stragglers and people who had run away from the front, that it shows very plainly that the great bulk of the troops on the field stood by their work and were in line when the battle ended. . . .

Thanking you heartily for the pains you have taken to investigate the subject and make it a matter of record, which is a good companion of Reed's book, I am,

Truly and cordially,

G. M. DODGE.

[Major General Grenville M. Dodge rendered conspicuous service throughout the Civil War, resigning March 1, 1866.]

HEADQUARTERS DEPARTMENT OF THE MISSOURI, OMAHA, NEBRASKA.

Nov. 28th, 1909.

MY DEAR MR. RICH:

Your Battle of Shiloh came in due time and was perused with intense interest from start to finish. It is by far the best and truest account that I have seen. The public, all who value truth in history, and all survivors of that great battle are indebted to you immeasurably. It has taken fifty years to get the truth before the public, refute the lies about, and correct the erroneous impressions of the circumstances of the battle. . . .

Faithfully,

CHAS. MORTON.

[Brigadier General, U. S. Army. Now commanding Department of the Missouri, Omaha, Nebraska. Was a private in the 25th Missouri Infantry, and was in the battle of Shiloh from opening to close.]



DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR  
BUREAU OF PENSIONS

CHICAGO, ILL., Nov. 28, 1909.

MY DEAR COMRADE RICH:

Last night, I went through it carefully, from start to finish. . . . and it stirred up such a flood of recollections, that I was afraid I never would go to sleep. I congratulate you most heartily on your effort, and consider your paper a very valuable addition to "the collections of Shiloh" . . . . There is much in your paper that is comparatively new, or at least the facts are presented in a new light.

Very truly your friend,

JOHN H. STIBBS.

[Colonel 12th Iowa Infantry and Brevet Brigadier General. Only surviving member of the Court that tried Gen. Wurz.]

PITTSBURG LANDING, TENN., Nov. 26, 1909.

DEAR COMRADE RICH:

My honest "unbiased opinion" is that your book makes many disputed points clear, and would convince any unprejudiced mind. . . .

D. W. REED.

[Secretary and Historian Shiloh National Military Park Commission. Major of the 12th Iowa Infantry.]

RUTLEDGE, MO., November 11th, 1909.

MY DEAR COMRADE:

Your Shiloh book received. The most authentic and valuable writing about the Battle that it has ever been my pleasure to read. Such a contrast from most of the misinformation heretofore written. You deserve the thanks of every survivor for the clear, comprehensive, and accurate way in which you tell the story. I have written some on the subject myself, and have read every scrap I could get hold of on the subject. But your book is, in my judgment, the best, the *very best*, that has ever appeared in print. . . .

Yours Fraternaly,

T. W. HOLMAN.

[Member of Company B, 21st Missouri Infantry. Commander of National Association of Battle of Shiloh Survivors.]

BOSTON, Dec. 28, 1909.

DEAR SIR:

I have read over, carefully, your paper on the battle of Shiloh; and what has particularly appealed to me is the prominence you have given to the part that Gen. Halleck's peremptory orders "to do nothing to bring on a general engagement" . . . . did in preparing for the mischief of the first day's battle. . . . I congratulate you upon the general soundness of your views with regard to the occurrence of the battle. . . .

Yours very truly,

FRANK E. PEABODY.

[Nephew of Colonel Peabody, commanding 1st Brigade, Prentiss's division.]



IOWA CITY, IOWA, 11/10/1909.

DEAR COMRADE:

I have received your admirable brochure on the Battle of Shiloh. I have read it, and my heart burned within me as your words so graphically, so accurately, so fully and yet so modestly pictured to my mind those scenes that tried men's souls.

I am especially thankful for the citations and explanations, drawn from Confederate reports which I had not before read. . . . Your defense of General Grant is powerful and timely, though modest and often unintentional.

Yours in F. C. L.

[Captain] E. H. ELY.

IOWA CITY, IOWA, November 22, 1909.

MY DEAR RICH:

Allow me to thank you for "The Battle of Shiloh". I read and read it again and shall still read it. It contains facts not found elsewhere. For your labor and research the public owe you a debt of gratitude.

To the old soldier who knows of Shiloh, it reads like a leaf from his own life. . . . I thank you, also congratulate you.

ELMER F. CLAPP.

MANCHESTER, IOWA, Dec. 5, 1909.

DEAR COMRADE RICH:

I am very thankful for the pamphlet, for I feel certain that it will do some good. I would like to see 100,000 copies or more distributed through the country.

Fraternally yours,

R. W. TIRRILL.

[Second Letter]

The paper is certainly the most lucid, unbiased, straight forward and complete article I have ever read on the battle of Shiloh. . . .

R. W. TIRRILL.

[Sergeant Company F., 12th Iowa Infantry.]

IOWA STATE LIBRARY, DES MOINES.

Dec. 23, 1909.

MY DEAR MR. RICH:

Thanks to you, I now see for the first time the battle as a whole. Your method may not be original, but it certainly is in its application to Shiloh. . . . You have enabled your readers to see all sides of disputed questions and to judge intelligently, not only as to the so-called "surprise" on Sunday morning and the closing of the Sunday night battle, but also as to the relative claims and assertions of Grant, Buell, Lew Wallace, and others. No student of history can afford to ignore your judicial estimate of this historic battle, fortified as it is at every point by authorities. . . .

Yours very truly,

JOHNSON BRIGHAM.

[State Librarian of Iowa]



VINTON, IOWA, Nov. 13, 1909.

MY DEAR COMRADE:

I have read and read The Battle of Shiloh with intense interest. . . . I have read everything that I could get bearing upon that battle. Your account is the best. . . .

As ever yours,  
[Captain] HENRY M. WILSON.

CLERMONT, IOWA, Dec. 15, 1909.

MY DEAR RICH:

The Battle of Shiloh I have read and re-read with much interest. I am glad indeed that you have written it. It gives, with the maps, the most comprehensive description of the battle that I have read. . . .

Yours truly,  
[Ex-Governor] WM. LARRABEE.

DES MOINES, IOWA, Dec. 15, 1909.

HON. B. F. SHAMBAUGH:

I consider the article on The Battle of Shiloh, by Mr. Rich, a valuable contribution to military history. I was through both days of that great battle. Commanded my regiment from 3 p. m. of April 6th to the close of the battle the next day. . . .

Yours very truly,  
[Colonel] G. W. CROSLY.

FAYETTE, IOWA, Nov. 15, 1909.

MY DEAR COMRADE:

I received your Battle of Shiloh . . . . read and read and studied the maps as never before. . . . All that is worrying me now is, that you or some other mortal did not do this very same thing forty years ago, so that the "boys" could have had the pleasure of *knowing* the facts. . . . I hope the book may go forth as thick as Autumn leaves, everywhere, till *all* may *know* the facts. . . . Our State is able to pay for the dissemination of the truth. . . .

Very truly yours,  
G. E. COMSTOCK.

[Corporal Company C., 12th Iowa Infantry.]

PHILADELPHIA, December 13, 1909.

MY DEAR SIR:

Whosoever has had the thoughtfulness to send me this paper has conferred an obligation. It shows an absolutely open mind and a very careful study of that memorable conflict. . . . I have always looked upon the stand of Stuart's Brigade as being of vital importance, and I am glad to see that you recognize it also. I do not know that I have read any paper or historical account of the battle which puts the error of those who claim that the army was demoralized by the first attack so conclusively. . . .

Very truly and respectfully yours,  
WALTER GEORGE SMITH.

[Son of Thomas Kilby Smith, Colonel 54th Ohio—Stuart's Brigade.]



WASHINGTON, IOWA, Dec. 7, 1909.

DEAR RICH:

I got your able article and finished reading it with great satisfaction. . . .  
—clear, thorough, convincing— and the very best thing I ever read on that  
battle. I had, until I read your proofs, always believed we were “surprised”  
there, but you converted me. I am very much obliged for this favor. . . .

HOWARD A. BURRELL.

[Editor of the *Washington Press* (Iowa).]

ELDORA, IOWA, 11/17/09.

DEAR SIR:

It is the best by far that I have ever seen. The maps give a clear idea of  
the battle. . . . Shiloh was the most desperate and the most lied about bat-  
tle of the whole war.

WALTER HARNED.

[An Illinois soldier in the Civil War.]

LAKE CHARLES, LA., Nov. 18, 1909.

DEAR MR. RICH:

I found every page of the article extremely interesting and was impressed,  
after reading every page, with the amount of labor . . . . devoted to read-  
ing and searching out your authorities. I am sure it will be looked upon as  
one of the most valuable contributions to the history of that event. . . .

Yours very truly,

FRANK ROBERTS.

IOWA CITY, IOWA, Nov. 13, 1909.

DEAR MR. RICH:

You are to be congratulated on making plain a much discussed subject. . . .

Very truly yours,

L. M. HASTINGS.

NEW YORK, Nov. 12, 1909.

MY DEAR MR. RICH:

I am very glad to see that you are making such a valuable contribution to  
the truth of history. It is a great pity that wrong impressions once started,  
however important the topic, seem never to get fully corrected. This, of course,  
is only another way of saying that truth never catches up with a lie. . . .

Yours sincerely,

GEORGE F. PARKER.



## CONTRIBUTOR

KENNETH W. COLGROVE, Scholar in the Department of Political Science at The State University of Iowa. (See THE IOWA JOURNAL OF HISTORY AND POLITICS for April, 1909, p. 328.)



# THE STATE HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF IOWA

ESTABLISHED BY LAW IN THE YEAR 1857

INCORPORATED: 1867 AND 1892

LOCATED AT IOWA CITY IOWA

## FORMER PRESIDENTS

JAMES W. GRIMES *First President*

RALPH P. LOWE

S. J. KIRKWOOD

F. H. LEE

W. PENN CLARKE

ROBERT HUTCHINSON

M. J. MORSMAN

WILLIAM G. HAMMOND

GEORGE G. WRIGHT

JOSIAH L. PICKARD

## OFFICERS

BENJAMIN F. SHAMBAUGH.....SUPERINTENDENT

EUCLID SANDERS.....PRESIDENT

LOVELL SWISHER.....TREASURER

FRANK E. HORACK.....SECRETARY

## BOARD OF CURATORS

*Elected by the Society*

*Appointed by the Governor*

M. W. DAVIS

PETER A. DEY

GEO. W. BALL

J. W. RICH

HENRY G. WALKER

EUCLID SANDERS

LAENAS G. WELD

ARTHUR J. COX

JAMES H. TREWIN

HARVEY INGHAM

JOHN SANDHAM

IRVING B. RICHMAN

E. W. STANTON

L. W. PARISH

J. J. McCONNELL

O. B. CLARK

CHARLES E. SHELTON

WILLIAM MILCHRIST

## MEMBERSHIP

Any person may become a member of THE STATE HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF IOWA upon election by the Board of Curators and the payment of an entrance fee of \$3.00.

Membership in this Society may be retained after the first year upon the payment of \$3.00 annually.

Members of the Society shall be entitled to receive the quarterly and all other publications of the Society during the continuance of their membership.

Any public, school, or college library in the State of Iowa may be enrolled as a library member upon application and the payment of a fee of \$1.00. Such library membership may be retained after the first year upon the payment of \$1.00 annually. Libraries enrolled as library members of THE STATE HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF IOWA shall be entitled to receive the quarterly and all other publications of the Society issued during the period of their membership.

*Address all Communications to*

THE STATE HISTORICAL SOCIETY IOWA CITY IOWA