

Understandably, neither McGinty nor Beck has anything to say about John Brown in Iowa, although McGinty does note that Governor Wise said that Iowan Edwin Coppoc of Springdale was the only one of Brown's raiders whose sentence he had ever thought of commuting (248). As it happens, Brown's first meeting with Emerson and Thoreau in Concord in 1857 came just after his return to the East from Kansas by way of Iowa. It might have been possible for Beck to compare their responses to the charismatic Brown with the impressions he made on Josiah B. Grinnell and the somewhat more skeptical Rev. John Todd, who perhaps knew Brown better.

Surely McGinty is correct in arguing that it was John Brown's trial rather than his aborted Harpers Ferry raid that set the stage for his role as a catalyst for secession and Civil War, and Beck shows us that the trial alone would not have ensured his place in history and legend without the literary productions of the New England Transcendentalists. Both have produced readable books that make significant contributions to our understanding of John Brown.

Heartland Utopias, by Robert P. Sutton. DeKalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 2009. 224 pp. Notes, bibliography, index. \$32.00 cloth.

Reviewer Peter Hoehnle is project manager for the Iowa Valley Resource Conservation and Development Council. He has written two articles about the Amanas for the *Annals of Iowa*, and his dissertation (Iowa State University, 2003) compared the organization of work in four communal societies.

Heartland Utopias was the final book written by the late Robert Sutton, long recognized as the foremost authority on the Icarian communities formed by followers of the nineteenth-century French Utopian socialist Etienne Cabet. The present volume focuses on the communal societies formed in the Midwest (here defined as the states of Ohio, Indiana, Illinois, Wisconsin, Michigan, Iowa, Missouri, and the Dakotas) in the nineteenth century. As one would expect, the chapter focusing on the turbulent 50-year history of the Icarians is well done, but otherwise the book suffers from numerous careless and unfortunate errors.

A broad survey of communal groups will, almost of necessity, be of uneven quality, reflecting the availability of records and other materials. *Heartland Utopias*, however, is constructed from secondary accounts and, like the unfortunately often cited work of Mark Halloway, is heavily dependent on Charles Nordhoff's *The Communistic Societies of the United States* (originally published in 1875). Although Nordhoff's observations are generally sound, they are those of a contemporary observer, not

a historian, and do not provide a complete or in-depth overview of a community's history.

Readers with an interest in Iowa history will find Sutton's treatment of the Amana Society — one of the largest and longest surviving of any utopian settlement in the Midwest — particularly disappointing. Sutton refers to Amana founder Christian Metz as "Merts" in one place (7), and relegates Metz's role as a community leader to that of assisting Barbara Heinemann Landmann. (Elsewhere Sutton claims that no woman ever "gained full leadership or control" over a religious utopian community, which is also contradicted by his mention of Lucy Wright, the undisputed head of the Shaker movement for more than 20 years, and the career of Mary Purnell of Mary's City of David.) Within a single paragraph Sutton provides two different numbers for the number of Metz's followers arriving in the Inspirationists' initial settlement at Ebenezer, New York (61). They purchased 5,000 acres in New York, not 4,000 (61); the Amana Society did not maintain "five flour mills" or allow newspapers to be sold within the colony; and at no time was East Amana the second-largest village, as implied (62). I also seriously doubt that "by the 1920s unmarried men [in Amana] had cars with radios" (63–64). I found at least 22 errors of fact in this section. More disappointing is that this significant community receives only five pages of commentary — a quarter of the space given to Icaria — and is lumped in a chapter titled "Other Separatist Communities."

The chapter on the Icarians, the group about which Sutton did pioneering scholarship, is the strongest one, although here, too, there are errors. The birth date of Icarian founder Etienne Cabet is given as 1782 (88) rather than the correct date of 1789, and Sutton fails to note the land issues that were at the root of the failure of the first Icarian colony in Texas. Somewhat more grating is Sutton's assertion, when discussing the Hutterites, that this group along with the Icarians formed the "longest-lived [utopian] experiments" (112). The Hutterites are, indeed, the longest lived communal movement in the heartland, but several communities, including the Amana Society (89 years), the House of David and Mary's City of David (currently 107 and 80 years, respectively), Reba Place (56 years), and several of the midwestern Shaker settlements, easily surpass Icaria's 50-year existence.

Although Sutton profiles a number of very short-lived Fourierist Phalanxes in Ohio, Wisconsin, and elsewhere, he excludes any mention of pioneering Iowa utopian communities such as the Jasper Colony or the Clydesdale Colony, which are referenced in other standard works.

Sutton's focus is historical, although he does include communities founded as late as the 1970s. His selection seems a bit arbitrarily confined to communities, such as Jesus People USA and Reba Place, that are located in his home state of Illinois. Oddly, his chapter on "Chicago Area Utopias" excludes any mention of Cyrus Teed's Koreshan Unity, certainly one of the most interesting utopian movements to develop in the American heartland.

Heartland Utopias will, one hopes, not be the final attempt to explore the interesting history of utopian communities in Iowa and neighboring states. The errors of fact and interpretation in this work seriously compromise what might have been a useful regional exploration of this rich topic. Many of these errors should have been detected by careful peer review; others probably would have been addressed had the author been able to see the book through publication.

The Welsh in Iowa, by Cherilyn A. Walley. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2009; distributed in the U.S. by University of Chicago Press. xi, 238 pp. Maps, graphs, tables, notes, appendixes, bibliography, index. \$60.00 cloth.

Reviewer Ron Roberts is professor emeritus of sociology at the University of Northern Iowa. His books include *The New Communes; Social Movements; Iowa's Ethnic Roots; Reinventing Inequality; John L. Lewis; and Mother Jones and Her Sisters*.

This new book on the migrations and settlement patterns of the Welsh in Iowa has all the strengths and weaknesses of a doctoral dissertation for the general reader of Iowa's ethnic history. Walley notes that Welsh mining towns and Welsh agricultural communities in Iowa in the nineteenth century shared the same cultural values and often the same language, but in both cases the Welsh were always a minority within the community. It is also true that they never presented a political threat (real or contrived) to the social order as did the Irish. Yet the Welsh did make an impact on midwestern states such as Iowa, and Walley meticulously documents their settlement in the state. She marshals an extraordinary amount of local history in her quest to tell the variegated story of the mining and farming communities inhabited by the Welsh.

I must admit to having at least two disparate views of her work. On the one hand, her descriptions of the nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Welsh mining towns could not find a better audience. My grandfather and his family worked for many years in the Monroe County coal mines near Hiteman. One of the other Welsh towns she describes is Cleveland, Iowa, which happens to be the birthplace of